# Retrieval-based Language Models 

Sewon Min

University of Washington
shmsw25.github.io

CPSC 488/588 • Fall 2023 • Yale University
Adapted from ACL 2023 Tutorial w/ Akari Asai, Zexuan Zhong, \& Danqi Chen

## Language Models <br> $P\left(x_{n} x_{1}, x_{2}, \cdots, x_{n-1}\right)$

## Language Models <br> $$
P\left(x_{n} x_{1}, x_{2}, \cdots, x_{n-1}\right)
$$

Harry felt Greenback collapse against ... on the floor as a jet of


## Language Models <br> $$
P\left(x_{n} x_{1}, x_{2}, \cdots, x_{n-1}\right)
$$

Harry felt Greenback collapse against ... on the floor as a jet of



## Language Models

$$
P\left(x_{n} x_{1}, x_{2}, \cdots, x_{n-1}\right)
$$

Harry felt Greenback collapse against ... on the floor as a jet of


## Retrieval-based language models (LMs)

(also called semiparametric or nonparametric LMs)

## Retrieval-based language models (LMs)

(also called semiparametric or nonparametric LMs)


## Retrieval-based language models (LMs)

(also called semiparametric or nonparametric LMs)


## Overview

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?

8
Tell me about Meta Platform.
I don't have any information about a
company called Meta Platforms. It
is possible that the company is ...

## Overview

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?



Tell me about Meta Platform.
I don't have any information about a company called Meta Platforms. It is possible that the company is ...

Retrieval Augmentation


## Overview

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?

Tell me about Meta Platform.I don't have any information about a company called Meta Platforms. It
is possible that the company is

## Retrieval Augmentation



New Retrieval-based LMs

"Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued $\qquad$ .. move and a flash of green light and
. just as a jet of red light blasted from Harry's
. is operated or driven by a jet of water. $\square$

## Overview

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?



Tell me about Meta Platform.
I don't have any information about a company called Meta Platforms. It
is possible that the company is

New Retrieval-based LMs

"Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued
 move and a flash of green light and just as a jet of red light blasted from Harry's $\square$ . is operated or driven by a jet of water. $\square$

Retrieval Augmentation


## Open Problems



Scaling datastore not just parameters?

## Overview

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?

Tell me about Meta Platform.I don't have any information about a company called Meta Platforms. It
is possible that the company is

New Retrieval-based LMs

"Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued
 move and a flash of green light and just as a jet of red light blasted from Harry's is operated or driven by a jet of water.

## Retrieval Augmentation



## Open Problems



Scaling datastore not just parameters?

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?

New dimension in data use \& better at long-tail

Can grow \& update w/o additional training

Provide data attribution

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?

New dimension in data use \& better at long-tail

Can grow \& update w/o additional training

Provide data attribution

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?

## New dimension in data use \& better at long-tail



Rarities of concepts/facts

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?

## New dimension in data use \& better at long-tail

## Can grow \& update w/o additional training




Standard LMs: Need to remember everything

Rarities of concepts/facts

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?

## New dimension in data use \& better at long-tail

## Can grow \& update w/o additional training



Rarities of concepts/facts


Standard LMs: Need to remember everything


Retrieval-based LMs: Can look-up anytime

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?

New dimension in data use \& better at long-tail

Can grow \& update w/o additional training

Provide data attribution

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?

New dimension in data use \& better at long-tail

Can grow \& update w/o additional training

Provide data attribution


## Why Retrieval-based LMs?

New dimension in data use \& better at long-tail

Can grow \& update w/o additional training

Provide data attribution

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?

New dimension in data use \& better at long-tail

Can grow \& update w/o additional training

Provide data attribution

0
List 4 important papers authored by Geoffrey Hinton

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?

New dimension in data use \& better at long-tail

## Can grow \& update w/o additional training

Provide data attribution

List 4 important papers authored by Geoffrey Hinton
Geoffrey Hinton is a renowned computer scientist ... Here are four important papers authored by him:

1. "Learning Internal Representations by Error Propagation" (with D. E. Rumelhart and R. J. Williams) - This paper, published in 1986, ..
2. "Deep Boltzmann Machines" (with R. Salakhutdinov) - Published in 2009,
3. "Deep Learning" (with Y. Bengio and A. Courville) - Published as a book in 2016, ...
4. "Attention Is All You Need" (with V. Vaswani, N. Shazeer, et al.) - Published in 2017, this paper introduced the Transformer model,...

## Overview

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?



Tell me about Meta Platform.
I don't have any information about a company called Meta Platforms. It
is possible that the company is

New Retrieval-based LMs

"Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued
 move and a flash of green light and

[^0]is operated or driven by a jet of water. $\square$

## Retrieval Augmentation



## Open Problems



Scaling datastore not just parameters?

## Language Models (w/o retrieval)



## Language Models (w/ retrieval)



## Language Models (w/ retrieval)



## Retrieval augmentation



## Retrieval augmentation: Overview

- Inference
- Training
- Key results


## Retrieval augmentation: Overview

- Inference
- Training
- Key results


## (I) Retrieve stage

Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued ...from ...

Voldemort's want just as a jet of red light
"The Boy Who Lived." He saw the mouth move and a flash of green.

## (I) Retrieve stage

```
Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued ...from ...
```

Voldemort's want just as a jet of red light


## (I) Retrieve stage

$\boldsymbol{X}=$ Harry felt Greenback collapse $\ldots$ on the floor as a jet of


## (I) Retrieve stage

## datastore ERow wiv

$\boldsymbol{X}=$ Harry felt Greenback collapse.. on the floor as a jet of

> Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued ...from ...

Voldemort's want just as a jet of red light
"The Boy Who Lived." He saw the mouth move and a flash of green...


## (I) Retrieve stage



## (I) Retrieve stage



## (2) Read stage

## Retrieval results (ranked)

Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued ...from ...

Voldemort's want just as a jet of red light
"The Boy Who Lived." He saw the mouth move and a flash of green ...

## (2) Read stage

Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued from
Retrieval results (ranked)
Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued ...from ... Voldemort's wand just as a jet of red light blasted from Harry's ...
$+$
Harry felt Greenback collapse against him ... a jet of

## (2) Read stage

Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued from
Retrieval results (ranked)
Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued ...from ..

Voldemort's want just as a jet of red light ...
"The Boy Who Lived." He saw the mouth move and a flash of green ...
$+$
Harry felt Greenback collapse against him ... a jet of


## (2) Read stage

Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued from
Retrieval results (ranked)
Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued ...from ..

Voldemort's want just as a jet of red light ...
"The Boy Who Lived." He saw the mouth move and a flash of green ...

Voldemort's wand just as a jet of red light blasted from Harry's ...
$+$
Harry felt Greenback collapse against him ... a jet of


## (2) Read stage

Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued from
Retrieval results (ranked)
Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued ...from ..

Voldemort's want just as a jet of red light ...
"The Boy Who Lived." He saw the mouth move and a flash of green ...

Voldemort's wand just as a jet of red light blasted from Harry's ...
$+$
Harry felt Greenback collapse against him ... a jet of


Very simple
(You can use a black-box LM like an API!)

## (2) Read stage

## How to use multiple text blocks?

Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued from
Retrieval results (ranked)
Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued ...from ..

Voldemort's want just as a jet of red light ...
"The Boy Who Lived." He saw the mouth move and a flash of green ...

Voldemort's wand just as a jet of red light blasted from Harry's ...
$+$
Harry felt Greenback collapse against him ... a jet of


## (2) Read stage

## How to use multiple text blocks?



## (2) Read stage

How to use multiple text blocks?

Retrieval results (ranked)


Voldemort's want just as a jet of red light ...


## (2) Read stage

How to use multiple text blocks? 1) Concatenation

Voldemort's want just as a jet of red light
Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued ...from "The Boy Who Lived." He saw the mouth move and a flash of green

## (2) Read stage

How to use multiple text blocks? 1) Concatenation

Voldemort's want just as a jet of red light
Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued ...from "The Boy Who Lived." He saw the mouth move and a flash of green
+
Harry felt Greenback collapse against him ... a jet of

## (2) Read stage

## How to use multiple text blocks? 1) Concatenation

Voldemort's want just as a jet of red light
Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued ...from "The Boy Who Lived." He saw the mouth move and a flash of green
$+$
Harry felt Greenback collapse against him ... a jet of


## (2) Read stage

## How to use multiple text blocks? 1) Concatenation

Voldemort's want just as a jet of red light
Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued ...from "The Boy Who Lived." He saw the mouth move and a flash of green
$+$
Harry felt Greenback collapse against him ... a jet of


- Simple

Increase the inference cost \&


Bounded by the maximum
length limit of the LM

## (2) Read stage

## How to use multiple text blocks? 2) Ensembling



## (2) Read stage

## How to use multiple text blocks? 2) Ensembling



## (2) Read stage

## How to use multiple text blocks? 2) Ensembling



## (2) Read stage

## How to use multiple text blocks? 2) Ensembling



## (2) Read stage

## How to use multiple text blocks? 2) Ensembling



## (2) Read stage

How to use multiple text blocks? 3) Reranking


## (2) Read stage

## How to use multiple text blocks? 3) Reranking

Retrieval results (ranked)


Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued from
Voldemort's wand just as a jet of red light blasted from Harry's
+
Harry felt Greenback collapse against him ... a jet of


## (2) Read stage

## How to use multiple text blocks? 3) Reranking

Retrieval results (ranked)


Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued from
Voldemort's wand just as a jet of red light blasted from Harry's
+
Harry felt Greenback collapse against him ... a jet of

$\therefore$ Increase the inference cost

## Key results

## Key results

## Perplexity: The lower the better

- No Retrieval In-Context RALM (BM25)



## Key results



## Retrieval helps over all sizes of LMs

## Retrieval augmentation: Overview

- Inference
- Step I: Retrieve
- Step 2: Read (Generate)
- Optionally, with multiple passages: Concatenation, Ensembling, Reranking
- Training
- Key results


## Retrieval augmentation: Overview

- Inference
- Step I: Retrieve
- Step 2: Read (Generate)
- Optionally, with multiple passages: Concatenation, Ensembling, Reranking
- Training
- Key results


## How to train it?

## Retrieval Model

trained in isolation
$\square$
LM
trained in isolation

## How to train it?

## Retrieval Model

trained in isolation


## How to train it?



## How to train it?

## Independent training

## Retrieval Model

trained in isolation

## How to train it?

Independent training

trained in isolation


Joint training


## How to train it?

Independent training

trained in isolation


Joint training


Sequential training
trained in isolation
Retrieval Model $\downarrow$
LM
trained conditionally

## How to train it?

Independent training


Joint training


Sequential training


## How to train it?

Independent training



Joint training
(Skipping details)


Sequential training
trained in isolation
Retrieval Model $\downarrow$

LM
trained conditionally
or
trained conditionally
Retrieval Model
$\uparrow$
LM
trained in isolation

## Sequential training: freeze LM, tune retrieval

## Sequential training: freeze LM, tune retrieval



## Sequential training: freeze LM, tune retrieval

Harry felt Greenback collapse against him ... on the floor as a jet of

Frozen
LM

LM

## Sequential training: freeze LM, tune retrieval



## Sequential training: freeze LM, tune retrieval



## Sequential training: freeze LM, tune retrieval



## Sequential training: freeze LM, tune retrieval



## Sequential training: freeze LM, tune retrieval



## Sequential training: freeze LM, tune retrieval



## Sequential training: freeze LM, tune retrieval



## Sequential training: freeze retrieval, tune LM

## Sequential training: freeze retrieval, tune LM

Harry felt Greenback collapse against him ... on the floor as a jet of

Ground truth token: green

## Sequential training: freeze retrieval, tune LM

Voldemort was ready. As Harry
Voldemort was ready. As Harry
shouted,"Expelliarmus!"
shouted,"Expelliarmus!"
Voldemort cried,"Avada
Voldemort cried,"Avada
Kedavra!'' A jet of green light
Kedavra!'' A jet of green light

## Sequential training: freeze retrieval, tune LM



## Sequential training: freeze retrieval, tune LM



$$
\text { Maximize } P(y x)=\sum_{z \in \mathscr{X}} P_{\mathrm{ret}}(z x) \xrightarrow[P_{\mathrm{LM}}(y x, z)]{\text { Updated }}
$$

## Summary:Training

Independent training


Joint training
(Skipping details)


Sequential training
trained in isolation
Retrieval Model $\downarrow$
LM
trained conditionally
or
trained in isolation
Retrieval Model


LM
trained conditionally

## Summary:Training

Independent training


Joint training
(Skipping details)


Sequential training
trained in isolation
Retrieval Model


LM
trained conditionally
or
trained in isolation
Retrieval Model


LM
trained conditionally

## Summary:Training

Independent training


Joint training
(Skipping details)


Sequential training
trained in isolation
Retrieval Model $\downarrow$
LM
trained conditionally
or
trained in isolation
Retrieval Model


LM
trained conditionally

Good enough if you want minimal effort

Principle way but still
open question
Good middle ground

## Retrieval augmentation: Overview

- Inference
- Step I: Retrieve
- Step 2: Read (Generate)
- Optionally, with multiple passages: Concatenation, Ensembling, Reranking
- Training
- Independent training, Joint training, Sequential training
- Key results


## Retrieval augmentation: Overview

- Inference
- Step I: Retrieve
- Step 2: Read (Generate)
- Optionally, with multiple passages: Concatenation, Ensembling, Reranking
- Training
- Independent training, Joint training, Sequential training
- Key results


## Question Answering

## Question Answering



Chinchilla (70B) ATLAS (Few; 11B) ATLAS (Full; 11B)

## Question Answering



## Question Answering



## Full-shot fine-tuning further improves performance

$\square$ Chinchilla (70B)
ATLAS (Few; 11B)

- ATLAS (Full; 11B)


## Question Answering

What is Kathy Saltzman's occupation?


## Question Answering



Gains increase as the rarity increases (even over GPT-3!)

## Reasoning (MMLU)

## Reasoning (MMLU)



## Code generation

TLDR (NL —> bash)


## Code generation

TLDR (NL —> bash)


## Large gains over both CodeT5 \& CodeX

## Can update effectively

## Can update effectively



## Can update effectively




## Can update effectively




## Instruction-tuning

## Instruction-tuning



## Retrieval augmentation: Summary

- Inference
- Step I: Retrieve
- Step 2: Read (Generate)
- Optionally, with multiple passages: Concatenation, Ensembling, Reranking
- Training
- Independent training, Joint training, Sequential training
- Key results
- QA, Reasoning, Code generation, etc
- Update effectively
- You can also do instruction tuning


## Retrieval Augmented LMs are already being used!



## Chat GPT Extension


:\# Perplexity


## Retrieval Augmented LMs are already being used!


$3 \beta \cdots$

Toronto is a vibrant and diverse city with many attractions and activities to suit different tastes and preferences. Here are some suggestions for creating an itinerary for exploring Toronto over two days:

- Day 1: Start your day with a visit to the CN Tower, the iconic landmark that offers panoramic views of the city and beyond ${ }^{1}$. You can also experience the thrill of walking on the glass floor or the EdgeWalk, the world's highest hands-free walk ${ }^{1}$. Next, head to the nearby $\mathbf{S t}$. Lawrence Market, one of the world's best food markets, where you can sample a variety of cuisines and local specialties ${ }^{2}$. After lunch, take a stroll along Queen West, a trendy neighborhood with eclectic shops, galleries, cafes and street art ${ }^{3}$. In the evening, enjoy a show at one of the many theaters or comedy clubs in the Entertainment District, or catch a game at the Scotiabank Arena if you're a sports fan.
- Day 2: Explore the history and culture of Toronto at the Royal Ontario Museum, one of the largest and most comprehensive museums in North America, featuring exhibits on art, natural history, world cultures and more 4 . Then, hop on a ferry to the Toronto Islands, a group of islands that offer a relaxing escape from the city, with beaches, parks, trails and amusement rides ${ }^{3}{ }^{5}$. You can also rent a bike or kayak to explore the islands at your own pace. For dinner, head to Chinatown, one of the largest and most vibrant in North America, where you can find a variety of Asian cuisines and shops ${ }^{3}$.

I hope this helps you plan your trip to Toronto. Have fun! (c)

## Learn more:

1. cntower.ca
2. travel.usnews.com
3. bing.com
4. rom.on.ca 5.tripadvisor.com

## Retrieval Augmented LMs are already being used!



Toronto is a vibrant and diverse city with many attractions and activities to suit different tastes and preferences. Here are some suggestions for creating an itinerary for exploring Toronto over two days:

- Day 1: Start your day with a visit to the CN Tower, the iconic landmark that offers panoramic views of the city and beyond ${ }^{1}$. You can also experience the thrill of walking on the glass floor or the EdgeWalk, the world's highest hands-free walk $\frac{1}{\sim}$ Next, head to the nearby $\mathbf{S t}$. Lawrence Market, one of the world's best food markets, where you can sample a variety of cuisines and local specialties ${ }^{2}$. After lunch, take a stroll along Queen West, a trendy neighborhood with eclectic shops, galleries, cafes and street art ${ }^{3}$. In the evening, enjoy a show at one of the many theaters or comedy clubs in the Entertainment District, or catch a game at the Scotiabank Arena if you're a sports fan.
- Day 2: Explore the history and culture of Toronto at the Royal Ontario Museum, one of the largest and most comprehensive museums in North America, featuring exhibits on art, natural history, world cultures and more ${ }^{4}$. Then, hop on a ferry to the Toronto Islands, a group of islands that offer a relaxing escape from the city, with beaches, parks, trails and amusement rides $\pi^{3 / 5}$. You can also rent a bike or kayak to explore the islands at your own pace. For dinner, head to Chiratown, one of the largest and most vibrant in Nortb/America, where you can find a variety of Asian cuisings and shops ${ }^{3}$
$\qquad$
- 1

Learn more:

1. cntower.ca
2. rom.on.ca
3. travel.usnews.com
4. bing.com
5. rom.on.ca 5.tripadvisor.com

## Overview

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?



Tell me about Meta Platform.
I don't have any information about a company called Meta Platforms. It
is possible that the company is

New Retrieval-based LMs


Retrieval Augmentation


## Open Problems



Scaling datastore not just parameters?

## New Retrieval-based LMs

- New Methodology I ——Designing a new Transformer
- New Methodology 2 - Designing a new Softmax
- New LM Design — Mitigating fairness \& legality issues


## New Retrieval-based LMs

1. How to overcome sequence length limit issue?
2. How to overcome efficiency issue when retrieving many blocks, frequently?

- New Methodology I - Designing a new Transformer
- New Methodology 2 - Designing a new Softmax
- New LM Design - Mitigating fairness \& legality issues


## RETRO (Borgeaud et al. 2021)

## RETRO (Borgeaud et al. 202I)

New Transformers layers, designed to read many text blocks, frequently, more efficiently

## RETRO (Borgeaud et al. 2021)

$\boldsymbol{x}=$ World Cup 2022 was the last with 32 teams, before the increase to

## RETRO (Borgeaud et al. 2021)

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathbf{x}=\text { World Cup } 2022 \text { was/the last with } 32 \text { teams, } / \text { before the increase to } \\
& \qquad \mathbf{x}_{1} \\
& \mathbf{x}_{2}
\end{aligned}
$$

## RETRO (Borgeaud et al. 2021)

$\boldsymbol{x}=$ World Cup 2022 was/the last with 32 teams, $/$ before the increase to
$\mathbf{x}_{1}$
$\mathbf{x}_{2}$


## RETRO (Borgeaud et al. 2021)

$\boldsymbol{x}=$ World Cup 2022 was/the last with 32 teams, $/$ before the increase to
$\mathbf{x}_{1} \quad \mathbf{x}_{3}$


## RETRO (Borgeaud et al. 202I)

$\boldsymbol{x}=$ World Cup 2022 was/the last with 32 teams, $/$ before the increase to
$\mathbf{x}_{1}$
$\mathbf{x}_{2}$


## RETRO (Borgeaud et al. 2021)

$\boldsymbol{x}=$ World Cup 2022 was/the last with 32 teams, $/$ before the increase to
$\mathbf{x}_{1} \quad \mathbf{x}_{3}$


## Regular Transformers



## RETRO Transformers



## Chunked Cross Attention



## Chunked Cross Attention



Outputs from the previous layer H

## Chunked Cross Attention



Outputs from the previous layer H

## Chunked Cross Attention



## Chunked Cross Attention



Outputs from the previous layer H
Cross-attention can be computed in parallel, and be re-used

## Chunked Cross Attention



Cross-attention can be computed in parallel, and be re-used

## Chunked Cross Attention



Cross-attention can be computed in parallel, and be re-used

## Chunked Cross Attention


$\checkmark$ Cross-attention can be computed in parallel, and be re-used

## Chunked Cross Attention



Cross-attention can be computed in parallel, and be re-used

## Results

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Moder |  |  |  |  |  |

## Results

| Model | Retrieval Set | \#Database tokens | Perplexity: The lower the better |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | \#Database keys | Valid | Test |
| Adaptive Inputs (Baevski and Auli, 2019) | - | - | - | 17.96 | 18.65 |
| Spalm (Yogatama et al., 2021) | Wikipedia | 3B | 3B | 17.20 | 17.60 |
| kNN-LM (Khandelwal et al., 2020) | Wikipedia | 3B | 3B | 16.06 | 16.12 |
| Megatron (Shoeybi et al., 2019) | - | - | - |  | 10.81 |
| Baseline transformer (ours) | - |  | - | 21.53 | 22.96 |
| kNN-LM (ours) | Wikipedia | 4B | 4B | 18.52 | 19.54 |
| Retro | Wikipedia | 4B | 0.06B | 18.46 | 18.97 |
| Retro | C4 | 174B | 2.9B | 12.87 | 10.23 |
| Retro | MassiveText (1\%) | 18B | 0.8B | 18.92 | 20.33 |
| Retro | MassiveText (10\%) | 179B | 4B | 13.54 | 14.95 |
| Retro | MassiveText (100\%) | 1792B | 28B | 3.21 | 3.92 |

## Results

| Model | Retrieval Set | \#Database tokens | Perplexity: The lower the better |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | \#Database keys | Valid | Test |
| Adaptive Inputs (Baevski and Auli, 2019) | - | - | - | 17.96 | 18.65 |
| Spalm (Yogatama et al., 2021) | Wikipedia | 3B | 3B | 17.20 | 17.60 |
| kNN-LM (Khandelwal et al., 2020) | Wikipedia | 3B | 3B | 16.06 | 16.12 |
| Megatron (Shoeybi et al., 2019) | - | - | - | - | 10.81 |
| Baseline transformer (ours) | - | - | - | 21.53 | 22.96 |
| kNN-LM (ours) | Wikipedia | 4B | 4B | 18.52 | 19.54 |
| Retro | Wikipedia | 4B | 0.06B | 18.46 | 18.97 |
| Retro | C4 | 174B | 2.9B | 12.87 | 10.23 |
| Retro | MassiveText (1\%) | 18B | 0.8B | 18.92 | 20.33 |
| Retro | MassiveText (10\%) | 179B | 4B | 13.54 | 14.95 |
| Retro | MassiveText (100\%) | 1792B | 28B | 3.21 | 3.92 |

## Significant improvements by retrieving from I. 8 trillion tokens

 (We'll talk more about the importance of the datastore size later)
## Results

| Model | Retrieval Set | \#Database tokens | Perplexity: The lower the better |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | \#Database keys | Valid | Test |
| Adaptive Inputs (Baevski and Auli, 2019) | - | - | - | 17.96 | 18.65 |
| Spalm (Yogatama et al., 2021) | Wikipedia | 3B | 3B | 17.20 | 17.60 |
| kNN-LM (Khandelwal et al., 2020) | Wikipedia | 3B | 3B | 16.06 | 16.12 |
| Megatron (Shoeybi et al., 2019) | - | - | - |  | 10.81 |
| Baseline transformer (ours) | - |  | - | 21.53 | 22.96 |
| kNN-LM (ours) | Wikipedia | 4B | 4B | 18.52 | 19.54 |
| Retro | Wikipedia | 4B | 0.06B | 18.46 | 18.97 |
| Retro | C4 | 174B | 2.98 | 12.87 | 10.23 |
| Retro | MassiveText (1\%) | 18B | 0.8 B | 18.92 | 20.33 |
| Retro | MassiveText (10\%) | 179B | 4B | 13.54 | 14.95 |
| Retro | MassiveText (100\%) | 1792B | 28B | 3.21 | 3.92 |

## Significant improvements by retrieving from I. 8 trillion tokens

 (We'll talk more about the importance of the datastore size later)
## New Retrieval-based LMs: Overview

- New Methodology I — Designing a new Transformer
- New attention layers to incorporate more blocks (RETRO)
- Possibly combine with long-range Transformers
- New Methodology 2 - Designing a new Softmax
- New LM Design - Mitigating fairness \& legality issues


## New Retrieval-based LMs: Overview

- New Methodology I — Designing a new Transformer
- New attention layers to incorporate more blocks (RETRO)
- Possibly combine with long-range Transformers

Solve length limit issue in retrieval augmentation

- New Methodology 2 - Designing a new Softmax
- New LM Design — Mitigating fairness \& legality issues


## New Retrieval-based LMs: Overview

- New Methodology I — Designing a new Transformer
- New attention layers to incorporate more blocks (RETRO)
- Possibly combine with long-range Transformers
- New Methodology 2 - Designing a new Softmax
- New LM Design — Mitigating fairness \& legality issues


## kNN-LM

| Test Context | Target |
| :---: | :---: |
| $x$ |  |
| Obama's birthplace is | $?$ |

## kNN-LM

|  |  |  | softmax | (y) |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Test Context <br> x | Target | Representation $q=f(x)$ |  | Hawaii Illinois | $0.2$ |
| Obama's birthplace is | ? | 0000 |  | ... | ... |

## kNN-LM


.. Obama was senator for Illinois from 1997 to 2005, .... Barack is Married to Michelle and their first daughter, ... Obama was born in Hawaii, and graduated from Columbia University. ... Obama is a native of Hawaii,

| Test Context <br> $x$ | Target | Representation <br> $q=f(x)$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Obama's birthplace is | $?$ | 000 |

## kNN-LM

| Training Contexts <br> $c_{i}$ | Targets <br> $v_{i}$ |
| ---: | :--- |
| Obama was senator for | Illinois |
| Barack is married to | Michelle |
| Obama was born in | Hawaii |
| $\ldots$ | $\ldots$ |
| Obama is a native of | Hawaii |


.. Obama was senator for Illinois from 1997 to 2005, .... Barack is Married to Michelle and their first daughter, ... Obama was born in Hawaii, and graduated from Columbia University. ... Obama is a native of Hawaii,

| Test Context | Target | Representation <br> $x=f(x)$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Obama's birthplace is | $?$ | 000 |

## kNN-LM

| Training Contexts $c_{i}$ | Targets <br> $v_{i}$ | Representations $k_{i}=f\left(c_{i}\right)$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Obama was senator for | Illinois | 000 |
| Barack is married to | Michelle | 0000 |
| Obama was born in | Hawaii | 0000 |
|  |  | O |
| Obama is a native of | Hawaii | 000 |


| Test Context | Target | Representation <br> $x=f(x)$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Obama's birthplace is | $?$ | 000 |

## kNN-LM

$\#$ of vectors $=\#$ of tokens in the corpus $(>\mid B)$

| Training Contexts $c_{i}$ | Targets $v_{i}$ | Representations $k_{i}=f\left(c_{i}\right)$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| was senator for | Illinois | , |
| Barack is married to | Michelle | 0000 |
| Obama was born in | Hawaii | 0000 |
|  |  |  |
| Obama is a native of | Hawaii | (000) |


| Test Context | Target | Representation <br> $x=f(x)$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Obama's birthplace is | $?$ | 000 |

## kNN-LM



Which tokens in a datastore are close to the next token?

## kNN-LM



Which tokens in a datastore are close to the next token?

Which vectors in a datastore are close to the vector we have?

## kNN-LM

| Training Contexts $c_{i}$ | Targets $v_{i}$ | Representations $k_{i}=f\left(c_{i}\right)$ | Distances <br> $d_{i}=d\left(q, k_{i}\right)$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Obama was senator for Barack is married to Obama was born in Obama is a native of | Illinois <br> Michelle <br> Hawaii <br> Hawaii | $\begin{gathered} 0000 \\ 0,000 \\ 0000 \\ \ldots \\ 0000 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 4 \\ 100 \\ 5 \\ \ldots \\ 3 \end{gathered}$ |
| Test Context $x$ | Target | Representation $q=f(x)$ |  |
| Obama's birthplace is | ? | 0000 |  |

## kNN-LM



## kNN-LM

Nonparamatric softmax


## kNN-LM

Nonparamatric softmax


$$
P_{k N N}\left(\begin{array}{ll}
y & x) \propto \sum_{(k, v) \in \mathscr{D}} \llbracket[v=y] e^{\operatorname{sim}(k, x)} \\
\end{array}\right.
$$

## kNN-LM

Nonparamatric softmax


$$
P_{k \mathrm{NN}}(y x) \propto \sum_{(k, v) \in \mathscr{D}} \square[v=y] e^{\operatorname{sim}(k, x)} \quad \operatorname{sim}(k, x)=-d(\operatorname{Enc}(k), \operatorname{Enc}(x))
$$

## kNN-LM

Nonparamatric softmax


$$
P_{k \mathrm{NN}}(y x) \propto \sum_{(k, v) \in \mathscr{X}} \square[v=y] e^{\operatorname{sim}(k, x)} \quad \operatorname{sim}(k, x)=-d(\operatorname{Enc}(k), \underline{\operatorname{Enc}(x))}
$$

## kNN-LM

Nonparamatric softmax


$$
P_{k \mathrm{NN}}(y x) \propto \sum_{(k, v) \in \mathscr{D}} \square[v=y] e^{\operatorname{sim}(k, x)} \quad \operatorname{sim}(k, x)=-d(\underline{\operatorname{Enc}(k)}, \underline{\operatorname{Enc}(x))}
$$

## kNN-LM

Nonparamatric softmax


## kNN-LM

Nonparamatric softmax


$$
P_{k \mathrm{NN}-\mathrm{LM}}\left(\begin{array}{ll}
y & x)=(1-\lambda) P_{\mathrm{LM}}\left(\begin{array}{ll}
y & x
\end{array}\right)+\lambda P_{k \mathrm{NN}}\left(\begin{array}{ll}
y & x
\end{array}\right) .
\end{array}\right.
$$

## kNN-LM

Nonparamatric softmax


$$
P_{k \mathrm{NN}-\mathrm{LM}}(y x)=(1-\lambda) P_{\mathrm{LM}}(y x)+\lambda P_{k \mathrm{NN}}\left(\begin{array}{ll}
y & x)
\end{array}\right.
$$

## kNN-LM



$$
P_{k \mathrm{NN}-\mathrm{LM}}\left(\begin{array}{ll}
y & x)=(1-\lambda) P_{\mathrm{LM}}\left(\begin{array}{ll}
( & x)
\end{array}\right) \lambda P_{k \mathrm{NN}}\left(\begin{array}{ll}
y & x
\end{array}\right) .
\end{array}\right.
$$

## kNN-LM



## Why nonparametric softmax?

| Training contexts | Targets |
| ---: | :--- |
| $10 / 10$, would buy this | cheap |
| Item delivered broken. Very | cheap |
| To check the version of PyTorch, you can use | torch |
| You are permitted to bring a | torch |
| A group of infections ... one of the | torch |

## Why nonparametric softmax?

| Training contexts | Targets |
| ---: | :--- |
| 10/10, would buy this | cheap |
| Item delivered broken. Very | cheap |
| To check the version of PyTorch, you can use | torch |
| You are permitted to bring a | torch |
| A group of infections ... one of the | torch |

## Why nonparametric softmax?

| Training contexts | Targets |
| ---: | :--- |
| 10/10, would buy this | cheap |
| Item delivered broken. Very | cheap |
| To check the version of PyTorch, you can use | torch |
| You are permitted to bring a | torch |
| A group of infections ... one of the | torch |

## Why nonparametric softmax?



## Why nonparametric softmax?

Dense vector space

| Training contexts | Targets |
| ---: | :--- |
| 10/10, would buy this | cheap |
| Item delivered broken. Very | cheap |
| To check the version of PyTorch, you can use | torch |
| You are permitted to bring a | torch |
| A group of infections ... one of the | torch |



## Why nonparametric softmax?



## Why nonparametric softmax?



## Why nonparametric softmax?

| Training contexts | Targets |
| ---: | :--- |
| 10/10, would buy this | cheap |
| Item delivered broken. Very | cheap |
| To check the version of PyTorch, you can use | torch |
| You are permitted to bring a | torch |
| A group of infections ... one of the | torch |

## Why nonparametric softmax?

| Training contexts | Targets |
| ---: | :--- |
| 10/10, would buy this | cheap |
| Item delivered broken. Very | cheap |
| To check the version of PyTorch, you can use | torch |
| You are permitted to bring a | torch |
| A group of infections ... one of the | torch |

## Why nonparametric softmax?



## Why nonparametric softmax?

| Training contexts | Targets |
| ---: | :--- |
| $10 / 10$, would buy this | cheap |
| Item delivered broken. Very | cheap |
| To check the version of PyTorch, you can use | torch |
| You are permitted to bring a | torch |
| A group of infections ... one of the | torch |

## Why nonparametric softmax?

Dense vector space

| Training contexts | Targets |
| ---: | :--- |
| $10 / 10$, would buy this | cheap |
| Item delivered broken. Very | cheap |
| To check the version of PyTorch, you can use | torch |
| You are permitted to bring a | torch |
| A group of infections ... one of the | torch |



## Why nonparametric softmax?



## Nonparametric-only, Phrase-level (NPM)

(If you can train the model...)

## Nonparametric-only, Phrase-level (NPM)

(If you can train the model...)

# Nonparametric-only, Phrase-level (NPM) 

 (If you can train the model...)
just as a jet of red light blasted from Harry's ..

Voldemort cried, "Avada Kedavra!' 'A jet of green light issued.
"The Boy Who Lived." He saw the mouth move and a flash of green light, and everything was gone.
... is operated or driven by a jet of water.

Pick up a flat rock, skip it across Green River

# Nonparametric-only, Phrase-level (NPM) 

(If you can train the model...)


# Nonparametric-only, Phrase-level (NPM) 

(If you can train the model...)


# Nonparametric-only, Phrase-level (NPM) 

(If you can train the model...)


NPM: Fact probing

## NPM: Fact probing



No-retrieval LMs are better as they get larger

## NPM: Fact probing



Retrieval augmentation helps

## NPM: Fact probing



NPM is more parameter efficient

## NPM: Predicting rare entities

## NPM: Predicting rare entities



## NPM: Predicting rare entities



## NPM: Predicting rare entities



NPM outperforms by a larger margin as the rarity increases

## New Retrieval-based LMs: Overview

- New Methodology I — Designing a new Transformer
- New attention layers to incorporate more blocks (RETRO)
- Possibly combine with long-range Transformers
- New Methodology 2 - Designing a new Softmax
- Two softmaxes together: kNN-LM
- Nonparametric softmax only, phrase-level: NPM
- New LM Design - Mitigating fairness \& legality issues


## New Retrieval-based LMs: Overview

- New Methodology I — Designing a new Transformer
- New attention layers to incorporate more blocks (RETRO)
- Possibly combine with long-range Transformers
- New Methodology 2 - Designing a new Softmax
- Two softmaxes together: kNN-LM
- Nonparametric softmax only, phrase-level: NPM
- New LM Design — Mitigating fairness \& legality issues


## Common practice

Web crawl


## Common practice



## Common practice


$\because$ Legal risk in training on copyrighted data

## Common practice


$\because$ Legal risk in training on copyrighted data

## New proposal: SILO



## New proposal: SILO



## New proposal: SILO



## New proposal: SILO



## New proposal: SILO



## New proposal: SILO



## SILO Attribution Example

## Test input:

include '../lib/admin.defines.php'; include '../lib/admin.module.access.php'; include '../lib/admin.smarty.php';
if (! has_right (

Continuation: [AC]X_BILLING)) \{ Header ..

## SILO Attribution Example



Continuation: [AC]×_BILLING)) \{ Header ..

## SILO Attribution Example



## SILO Attribution Example



## New Retrieval-based LMs: Summary

- New Methodology I — Designing a new Transformer
- New attention layers to incorporate more blocks (RETRO)
- New Methodology 2 - Designing a new Softmax
- Two softmaxes together: kNN-LM
- Nonparametric softmax only, phrase-level: NPM
- New LM Design — Mitigating fairness \& legality issues
- Train on permissive text $\rightarrow$ place copyrighted text into a datastore


## Overview

## Why Retrieval-based LMs?



Tell me about Meta Platform.
I don't have any information about a company called Meta Platforms. It
is possible that the company is

New Retrieval-based LMs

"Avada Kedavra!" A jet of green light issued
$-$ move and a flash of green light and just as a jet of red light blasted from Harry's $\square$ is operated or driven by a jet of water.

Retrieval Augmentation


## Open Problems



Scaling datastore not just parameters?

## Summary

What?
How?
Why?

## Summary



## Summary



## Summary



## Summary

## What?



## Summary



Why?

New dimension in improving LMs!

## Summary

What?

$x$ : test input
$y$ : model prediction to $x$

How?

Retrieval augmentation

New Transformers

Nonparametric Softmax

## Why?

> New dimension in improving LMs!

Update \& scale without additional training

## Summary



## Why?

New dimension in improving LMs!

Update \& scale without additional training

## Summary

## slide $96 \downarrow$

## Test input:


include '../lib/admin.defines.php';
include "../lib/admin.module.access.php';
include '../lib/admin.smarty.php';
if (! has_right (
Continuation: [AC]X_BILLING)) \{ Header .

## Why?

> New dimension in improving LMs!

Update \& scale without additional training

## Top-I retrieved context:

* You should have received a copy of the GNU Affero General Public License
* along with this program. If not, see [http://wmw.gnu.org/licenses/](http://wmw.gnu.org/licenses/).
$\rightarrow{ }^{*}$
* 

if (! has_right (
[AC]X_ACCESS)) $\{$ Header

## Summary

## slide $96 \downarrow$

## Test input:

include '../lib/admin.defines.php';
include '../lib/admin.module.access.php';
include '../lib/admin.smarty.php';
if (! has_right (
Continuation: [AC]X_BILLING)) \{ Header .


## Top-I retrieved context:

* You should have received a copy of the GNU Affero General Public License
* along with this program. If not, see [http://www.gnu.org/licenses/](http://www.gnu.org/licenses/).
* 

**/
if (! has_right (
[AC]X_ACCESS)) $\{$ Header

## Why?

> New dimension in improving LMs!

Update \& scale without additional training

Provide data attribution

New opportunities in fairness \& legality

## Summary



How?

Retrieval
augmentation

New Transformers

Nonparametric Softmax

New opportunities in fairness \& legality

Open questions

## Open question: Scaling retrieval-based LMs

## Open question: Scaling retrieval-based LMs

A small LM + a large datastore $\approx$ a large (no-retrieval) LM?

vs.


## Open question: Scaling retrieval-based LMs

A small $\mathrm{LM}+$ a large datastore $\approx$ a large (no-retrieval) LM?

vs.




A new dimension in scaling!

## Open question: Scaling retrieval-based LMs

## A small LM + a large datastore $\approx$ a large (no-retrieval) LM?


vS.


|  | \# of parameters | \# of tokens |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| KNN-LM (Khandelwal et al., 2020) | 250 M | $\leq 3 \mathrm{~B}$ |
| NPM (Min et al., 2023) | 350 M | 1 B |
| Atlas (Izacard et al., 2022) | 11 B | $\sim 30 \mathrm{~B}$ |
| RETRO (Borgeaud et al., 2021) | 7 B | 2 T |
| $\quad$ REPLUG (Shi et al., 2023) | $\leq 175 \mathrm{~B}$ | $\sim 5 \mathrm{~B}$ |

## Open question: Scaling retrieval-based LMs

## A small LM + a large datastore $\approx$ a large (no-retrieval) LM?


vS.


|  | \# of parameters | \# of tokens |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| KNN-LM (Khandelwal et al., 2020) | 250 M | $\leq 3 \mathrm{~B}$ |
| NPM (Min et al., 2023) | 350 M | 1 B |
| Atlas (Izacard et al., 2022) | 11 B | $\sim 30 \mathrm{~B}$ |
| RETRO (Borgeaud et al., 2021) | 7 B | 2 T |
| $\quad$ REPLUG (Shi et al., 2023) | $\leq 175 \mathrm{~B}$ | $\sim 5 \mathrm{~B}$ |

## Open question: Scaling retrieval-based LMs

Scaling law?

## Open question: Scaling retrieval-based LMs

Scaling law?


Loss as a function of:

- Training data size
-\# model parameters

Scaling law for parametric LMs (Kalpan et al., 2020; Hoffman et al., 2022)

## Open question: Scaling retrieval-based LMs

Scaling law?


Loss as a function of:

- Training data size
-\# model parameters
+ Datastore sizes?

Scaling law for parametric LMs (Kalpan et al., 2020; Hoffman et al., 2022)

# Open question: Runtime efficiency 

Efficiency of similarity search

## Open question: Runtime efficiency

Efficiency of similarity search

Measured on NVIDIA RTX 3090 GPU (Zhong et al., 2022)
with a FAISS indexer (Johnson et al., 2021) with 32 CPUs


[^1]
## Open question: Runtime efficiency

Efficiency of similarity search

Measured on NVIDIA RTX 3090 GPU (Zhong et al., 2022)
with a FAISS indexer (Johnson et al., 2021) with 32 CPUs


[^2]
## Open question: Runtime efficiency

Efficiency of similarity search

Measured on NVIDIA RTX 3090 GPU (Zhong et al., 2022)
with a FAISS indexer (Johnson et al., 2021) with 32 CPUs


- $>12$ times slower with approximate nearest neighbor search
- Efficient similarity search is an active research area (in conjunction with systems, databases, \& algorithms)


Open question: Retrieval-based LMs for applications

## Open question: Retrieval-based LMs for applications

Open-ended text generation?


## Open question: Retrieval-based LMs for applications

Open-ended text generation?


Better decoding algorithms? Better adaptation methods?

Open questions: Summary

## Open questions: Summary

- What is the best architecture \& training method for retrieval-based LMs in practice?


## Open questions: Summary

- What is the best architecture \& training method for retrieval-based LMs in practice?
- How to scale the datastore to trillions of tokens? [Scaling law]


## Open questions: Summary

- What is the best architecture \& training method for retrieval-based LMs in practice?
- How to scale the datastore to trillions of tokens? [Scaling law]
- How to improve runtime efficiency?


## Open questions: Summary

- What is the best architecture \& training method for retrieval-based LMs in practice?
- How to scale the datastore to trillions of tokens? [Scaling law]
- How to improve runtime efficiency?
- How to design new decoding or adaptation methods for downstream tasks (e.g., open-ended text generation)!


## Open questions: Summary

- What is the best architecture \& training method for retrieval-based LMs in practice?
- How to scale the datastore to trillions of tokens? [Scaling law]
- How to improve runtime efficiency?

- How to design new decoding or adaptation methods for downstream tasks (e.g., open-ended text generation)!


## Q \& A

## Thank you for listening!

Check out ACL 2023 Tutorial on this topic (3-hour): https://acl2023-retrieval-Im.github.io/ Please leave feedback at tinyurl.com/sewon-min-talk

## Extra slides (from QnA)

## Validating Model Output to be Factual

Bridget Moynahan is an American actress, model and producer. She is best known for her roles in Grey's Anatomy, I, Robot and Blue Bloods. She studied acting at the American Academy of Dramatic Arts, and ...

## Atomic facts

- Bridget Moynahan is American
- Bridget Moynahan is an actress
- Bridget Moynahan is a model.
- Bridget Moynahan is a producer. K
- She is best known for her roles in Grey's Anatomy.
- She is best known for her roles in I, Robot.
66.7\%
- She is best known for her roles in Blue Bloods.
- She studied acting.
- She studied at the American Academy of Dramatic Arts. X.


## Gains from retrieval w.r.t. frequency



There has been mixed results about whether retrieval hurts when it comes to popular entities/facts, e.g., the top graph shows it does hurt in (short-form) question answering, and the bottom graph shows retrieval always help even with frequent entities in long-form text generation. These results are likely to depend on exact setup, e.g., the task, base LMs, and datastore, etc.

Mallen et al. 2023. "When Not to Trust Language Models: Investigating Effectiveness of Parametric and Non-Parametric Memories"


## Research on information retrieval



Retrieval-including training the encoder, getting embeddings and indexing - is an active area of research. Recommend Pyserini (https://github.com/castorini/pyserini) for a set of references and also try some of them out easily.

## State-of-the-art retrieval-based LMs?

- If you want the model that you can use right now - retrieval-augmentation
- Partially because you can leverage the state-of-the-art models that industry built with no modification
- You should use state-of-the-art retrieval (BM25, Contriever or GTR) and state-of-the-art LM (LLAMA, ChatGPT)
- Easiest: with "independent training", optionally with reranking
- Doesn't mean retrieval-augmentation is the "best" under the scenario of fair comparison, e.g., when the model has exact same parameters \& is trained on the exactly same data
- The SILO paper shows kNN-LM (kNN in the graph) outperforms retrieval-augmentation (RiC in the graph), both when training data==datastore (right) and when training data!=datastore (left)
- However, this is based on language modeling perplexity. Downstream task eval is still an open Q.




[^0]:    just as a jet of red light blasted from Harry's

[^1]:    LM: 250M
    Datastore: 100M

[^2]:    LM: 250M
    Datastore: 100M

